
Executive

21 July 2009

Report of the Democratic Services Manager

Final Report of the Hungate Ad-hoc Scrutiny Committee

Summary

1. This report presents the final report from the Hungate Ad-hoc Scrutiny Committee detailing their review of the Hungate development.

Background

2. In coming to a decision to carry out a review of this topic, the Scrutiny Management Team recognised certain key objectives and the following remit was agreed:

Aim

To clarify whether the correct strategy for the accommodation project was set and adhered to, in order to ensure any future council projects are delivered on time and on budget.

Objectives

- i. In light of the overall budget, to identify whether the initial budget set was correct i.e. that all the relevant factors had been identified and included for, including the volume of all fees both agreed and incurred
- ii. To understand the decision taken in respect of agreeing which part of CYC would act as internal 'client' and to understand the relationship between Planning and the client.
- iii. To identify whether the consultation process was conducted properly and whether due consideration was given to the responses received when deciding how to proceed
- iv. To identify whether best practice was followed throughout the process in seeking the views of statutory consultees and English Heritage specifically, and whether those views unduly influenced the decisions made

- v. To identify whether time was a factor in reaching the decisions made throughout the process e.g. in agreeing the design
3. The final report was presented to Scrutiny Management Committee on 18 May 2009 and although they endorsed the recommendations made, they expressed concern that the review had not been carried out within the agreed timescale set for the review and that the remit of the review had been such that questions remained unanswered. SMC suggested that the information collected during the course of the review could form the basis of a broader review into the wider issues raised, and agreed that any new scrutiny review would benefit from being carried out by the same Ad-Hoc Scrutiny Committee Members. Members of SMC agreed to individually consider what questions remained unanswered but to date, no further topic has been registered.

Consultation

4. As part of their review, the Hungate Ad-hoc Scrutiny Committee carried out a number of consultation sessions, as detailed in their final report attached at Appendix A.

Options

5. Having considered the findings contained within the final report attached and its associated Annexes A-F, Members may choose to approve all, some or none of the recommendations shown in paragraph 7 below.

Analysis

6. In regard to the aims and objectives of the review, the final report attached, analyses all of the information gathered and the arising issues.

Summary of Recommendations Arising From the Review

7. The final report of the Hungate Ad-hoc Scrutiny Committee recommends that the Executive should:
 - i. Carry out pre-project public consultation before commencing on any major project to identify and take account of the level of public support, in order to inform the project including the budget
 - ii. Continue with its best practice approach to pre-application consultation
 - iii. Agree a code of practice with statutory consultees which seeks to ensure they provide clear, consistent, timely and documented responses to consultation, from persons in authority within their organisation

- iv. Always provide full and consistent feedback to all consultees no matter whether the Council is able to respond positively or negatively to the issues being raised
- v. For all major projects, ensure that the Chief Executive and Senior Directors take ownership of the project and give consistent support to the project team

Reason: To ensure that any future projects are managed effectively and take into account lessons learnt from this review.

Corporate Direction & Priorities

- 8. The provision of the new accommodation and the consequential improvements in services to our customers will contribute to all of the Council's priorities and key change programmes.

Implications

- 9. There are no known Legal, Financial, Equalities, HR, or other implications associated with the recommendation below. The implications associated with the recommendations within the final report are detailed in paragraphs 50 & 51 of Appendix A.

Risk Management

- 10. There are no known risks associated with the recommendation within this cover report. The risks associated with the recommendations within the final report are detailed therein.

Recommendations

- 11. Members are asked to note the contents of the attached final report and approve the recommendations as shown in paragraph 7 above.

Reason: To ensure any future council projects are delivered on time and on budget.

Contact Details

Author:
 Melanie Carr
 Scrutiny Officer
 Scrutiny Services
 Tel No.01904 552063

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:
 Dawn Steel
 Democratic Services Manager

Report Approved **Date** 6 July 2009

Wards Affected: **All**
 For further information please contact the author of the report

Background Papers: None

Annexes

Appendix A – Hungate Ad-hoc Scrutiny Review - Final Report dated 1 May 2009

Annex A – Budget History Information

Annex B – English Heritage Internal Memo dated 2 January 2008

Annex C – Image provided by York's Civic Trust

Annex D – English Heritage Email dated 10 September 2007

Annex E – FOI Documentation Received From English Heritage

Annex F – Written Response from English Heritage